

THE VIEW AT EASTCOAST BY ROCKROSE

CONDOMINIUM RESIDENCES
4630 CENTER BOULEVARD
LONG ISLAND CITY, NY
877.LC.7778

110% BUY BACK GUARANTEE
VISIT NOW

Advertise on NYTimes.com

Report on Gene for Depression Is Now Faulted

By BENEDICT CAREY
Published: June 16, 2009

One of the most celebrated findings in modern [psychiatry](#) — that a single gene helps determine one's risk of depression in response to a divorce, a lost job or another serious reversal — has not held up to scientific scrutiny, researchers reported Tuesday.

RSS Feed

[Get Science News From The New York Times »](#)

Readers' Comments

Readers shared their thoughts on this article.
[Read All Comments \(48\) »](#)

between genes and life experience are trivial; they are almost certainly fundamental, experts agree.

But it does suggest that nailing down those factors in a precise way is far more difficult than scientists believed even a few years ago, and that the original finding could have been due to chance. The new report is likely to inflame a debate over the direction of the field itself, which has found that the [genetics](#) of illnesses like [schizophrenia](#) and [bipolar disorder](#) remain elusive.

"This gene/life experience paradigm has been very influential in psychiatry, both in the studies people have done and the way data has been interpreted," said Dr. Kenneth S. Kendler, a professor of psychiatry and human genetics at [Virginia Commonwealth University](#), "and I think this paper really takes the wind out of its sails."

Others said the new analysis was unjustifiably dismissive. "What is needed is not less research into gene-environment interaction," Avshalom Caspi, a neuroscientist at [Duke University](#) and lead author of the original paper, wrote in an e-mail message, "but more research of better quality."

The original study was so compelling because it explained how nature and nurture could collude to produce a complex mood problem. It followed 847 people from birth to age 26 and found that those most likely to sink into depression after a stressful event — job loss, sexual abuse, bankruptcy — had a particular variant of a gene involved in the regulation of serotonin, a brain messenger that affects mood. Those in the study with another variant of the gene were significantly more resilient.

"I think what happened is that people who'd been working in this field for so long were

COMMENTS (48)

SIGN IN TO E-MAIL

PRINT

REPRINTS

SHARE

ARTICLE TOOLS
SPONSORED BY



[More Articles in Science »](#)

Stuart Elliott's In Advertising E-mail



Sign up for Stuart Elliott's exclusive column, sent every Monday.

Sign Up

[See Sample](#) | [Privacy Policy](#)



Only 2 ingredients.

Anti-aging, anti-redness skin care for sensitive skin

developed by scientists in the Netherlands.

Try a sample for the cost of shipping

Advertise on NYTimes.com

MOST POPULAR

E-MAILED BLOGGED SEARCHED

1. [Nicholas D. Kristof: The Best Kids' Books Ever](#)
2. [David Brooks: In Search of Dignity](#)
3. [Well: Eating to Fuel Exercise](#)
4. [New Light in Old Bulbs](#)
5. [Maureen Dowd: Now, Sarah's Folly](#)
6. [Paul Krugman: HELP Is on the Way](#)
7. [Ex-Defense Secretary Robert S. McNamara Dies at 93](#)
8. [Street Farmer](#)
9. [Mind: Why the Imp in Your Brain Gets Out](#)
10. [Bob Herbert: After the War Was Over](#)

[Go to Complete List »](#)



Neda, Obama and the power

desperate to have any solid finding," Kathleen R. Merikangas, chief of the genetic epidemiology research branch of the National Institute of Mental Health and senior author of the new analysis, said in a phone interview. "It was exciting, and some people thought it was the finding in psychiatry, a major advance."

The excitement spread quickly. Newspapers and magazines [reported the finding](#). Columnists, commentators and op-ed writers emphasized its importance. The study provided some despairing patients with comfort, and an excuse — "Well, it is in my genes." It reassured some doctors that they were medicating an organic disorder, and stirred interest in genetic testing for depression risk.

Since then, researchers have tried to replicate the gene finding in more than a dozen studies. Some found similar results; others did not. In the new study, being published Wednesday in The Journal of the American Medical Association, Neil Risch of the [University of California](#), San Francisco, and Dr. Merikangas led a coalition of researchers who identified 14 studies that gathered the same kinds of data as the original study. The authors reanalyzed the data and found "no evidence of an association between the serotonin gene and the risk of depression," no matter what people's life experience was, Dr. Merikangas said.

By contrast, she said, a major stressful event, like divorce, in itself raised the risk of depression by 40 percent.

The authors conclude that the widespread acceptance of the original findings was premature, writing that "it is critical that health practitioners and scientists in other disciplines recognize the importance of replication of such findings before they can serve as valid indicators of disease risk" or otherwise change practice.

Dr. Caspi and other psychiatric researchers said it would be equally premature to abandon research into gene-environment interaction, when brain imaging and other kinds of evidence have linked the serotonin gene to [stress](#) sensitivity.

"This is an excellent review paper, no one is questioning that," said Myrna Weissman, a professor of epidemiology and psychiatry at Columbia. "But it ignored extensive evidence from humans and animals linking excessive sensitivity to stress" to the serotonin gene.

Dr. Merikangas said she and her co-authors deliberately confined themselves to studies that could be directly compared to the original. "We were looking for replication," she said.

A version of this article appeared in print on June 17, 2009, on page A15 of the New York edition.

[More Articles in Science »](#)

of pictures

Also on NYTimes.com

[Having a child to save a life](#)

[Behind the scenes: photographing Michael](#)

nytimes.com

ADVERTISEMENTS



Ads by Google

what's this?

[Mental](#)

Feeling Depressed? Tips For Coping and Taking Control
www.healthcentral.com

[Mental Health CEUs](#)

Instant Credit for OnDemand Audio, Video, Podcasts & Webcasts
online.pesi.com

[Bipolar Disability Claims](#)

Helping People With Bipolar Get The Monthly Income They Need- Get Info!
www.Allsup.com



[Click here to enjoy the convenience of home delivery of The Times for 50% off.](#)

Ads by Google

what's this?

[Bipolar Disorder Resource](#)

Get Health and Medical Information Depression Facts and More
Health.com

[Is Bipolar Hereditary?](#)

The Latest News, Info & Support for Bipolar Disorder. Get Answers Now!
www.EverydayHealth.com

[Mental Health CEUs](#)

Instant Credit for OnDemand Audio, Video, Podcasts & Webcasts
online.pesi.com

Past Coverage

[F.D.A. Requiring Suicide Studies In Drug Trials](#) (January 24, 2008)
[BEHAVIOR: On the Horizon, Personalized Depression Drugs](#) (June 19, 2007)

New Report on Stress And Depression Link (December 17, 2004)
Study Pursues A Genetic Link To Depression (December 10, 2004)

Related Searches

- Genetics and Heredity [Get E-Mail Alerts](#)
- Depression (Mental) [Get E-Mail Alerts](#)
- Mental Health and Disorders [Get E-Mail Alerts](#)
- Research [Get E-Mail Alerts](#)

INSIDE NYTIMES.COM



HEALTH »



Why the Imp in Your Brain Gets Out

SPORTS »



An Endurance Impresario Faces His Own Challenge

N.Y. / REGION »



A Lens on the Ruins Amid the Gowanus Rebirth

OPINION »

Stanley Fish: Palin and Sanford
 Their failings are more palatable than the behavior of the pundits who are having fun at their expense.

ART & DESIGN »



Future Vision Banished to the Past

OPINION »



Op-Ed: Who Cares About Zelaya?